Appendix A

Analysis of Scoping Comments

Big Basin Spur Roads Decommissioning Project

Two individuals/organizations commented during the public comment period of September 28, 2017 to October 27, 2017. The disposition of the comments are found in the Table below. The original comment letters are available in the project record.

Comment Analysis

Commenter	Comment	Disposition
	The ICL generally supports this project.	Thank you for your comment.
Brad Smith, Idaho Conservation League	We question the need for "an opening at the top of the road cut-slope would be left to allow foot access". Unless there is a trail, campsite, or other noteworthy feature where foot access is warranted, ICL would discourage this practice. It has the potential to invite illegal off-road vehicle traffic, invasive weeds and erosion.	From past comments, we learned the public found the natural mulch from the removed trees and brush along the recontoured surface was too thick for easy walking. In response, an area at the top of the recontoured surface was left free of mulch/slash to allow for easier foot travel. Although monitoring has not found an increase in erosion as a result of leaving the narrow footpath, encroachment by invasive plants has increased in areas receiving higher public use. As stated in the scoping letter, roads will be treated for invasive plants before decommissioning, and monitored for weed infestations post-completion and treated accordingly.
Daniel Stewart Idaho Dept. of Env. Quality	 For TMDL waters listed in Category 4: Project activities may affect the NP-CW NF's ability to achieve flow based on pollutant allocation reduction associated with Forest land or management activities. Projects initiated after the establishment of TMDL pollutant load allocations can adversely affect water quality through a reduction in load capacity. For projects on 303(d) impaired waters listed in Category 5: 	Thank you for your comment.
	 Project activities may affect the Nez Perce-Clearwater National Forest's ability to support designated and existing beneficial uses. 	Thank you for your comment.